



TO: SUNY University Faculty Senate
FROM: Executive Committee
RE: New York State Fiscal Year 2025 Executive Budget Resolution
DATE: 195th Plenary, October 19-21, 2023
LOCATION: SUNY Geneseo
RESOLUTION #: 195-02-1
VOTE: For: 49 / Against: 0

RATIONALE:

WHEREAS Governor Kathy Hochul has already demonstrated how well she understands that in fulfilling their core academic missions, the State University of New York (SUNY) and the City University of New York (CUNY) advance the public good by transforming students' lives and life chances and serving New York State (NYS) as anchors of community, foundations for democracy, platforms for civic engagement, engines of economic development, pathways to the middle class and beyond, magnets for population growth and private investment, generators of creativity and innovation, and seedbeds for health and human flourishing¹; and

WHEREAS SUNY University Faculty Senate (UFS) welcomes and applauds the State Fiscal Year 2024 (SFY24) Enacted Budget's record increase of \$163 million in state operating aid; continuation of funding for new full-time faculty and transformational funding; hospital debt service relief and other funding mechanisms that can benefit SUNY teaching hospitals; maintenance of funding for the Tuition Assistance Program, the Educational Opportunity Program, and other student opportunity programs; and an endowment match for our university centers; and

WHEREAS Governor Hochul has a historic opportunity in her SFY25 Executive Budget to make NYS a national leader in college affordability and in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY's missions; and

WHEREAS SUNY UFS has worked closely for many years with the SUNY Faculty Council of Community Colleges (SUNY FCCC) and the CUNY University Faculty Senate (CUNY UFS), and in alliance with the SUNY Student Assembly (SUNY SA), United University Professions (UUP), and the CUNY Professional Staff Congress (PSC-CUNY) in advocating for NYS to become a national leader in investing direct state aid in SUNY and CUNY's core operating budgets²;

WHEREAS SUNY institutions have been making sincere efforts to fulfill their missions despite the mismatch between their resources and their obligations³; and

RESOLUTION:

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY University Faculty Senate (SUNY UFS) charges President Landa to work with SUNY System Administration on Executive Budget research and advocacy with Governor Hochul and her staff and to coordinate efforts with CUNY University Faculty Senate and CUNY System Administration leadership; and

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY UFS urges Chancellor King to work with Governor Hochul to craft an SFY25 Executive Budget that makes New York State a national leader in college affordability and in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY's missions by providing each SUNY institution with a secure direct state aid foundation, by developing a more equitable and differentiated system of tuition and fees, and by expanding eligibility for, increasing amounts of, and extending applicability of student financial aid, through the following means:

Direct State Aid

- putting an end to the era of annual real-dollar operating budget cuts to SUNY;
- fully funding all negotiated contractual increases and other mandatory operating cost increases for all SUNY institutions, including SUNY hospitals;
- beginning to make each SUNY institution whole from the cuts in direct state aid to their operating budgets since the Great Recession (including SUNY hospitals for the withdrawal of mission funding that predates the Great Recession);

Indirect State Aid

- fully funding debt service and fringe benefits for all SUNY institutions, including SUNY hospitals;
- expanding financial aid eligibility for New Yorkers;
- increasing financial aid amounts for New Yorkers;
- ensuring that state scholarships and grants can be used on any cost associated with attendance at any SUNY campus;
- rethinking the parameters of the Excelsior Scholarship;

Capital Funding

- providing a multi-year capital plan to make each SUNY institution a safer, healthier, greener, and more accessible and engaging place to teach, research, live, learn, and work; and

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY UFS calls on all SUNY campus governance bodies, along with all friends and all other good-faith partners of SUNY and CUNY, to speedily pass resolutions aligned with ours, and in those resolutions to encourage their constituencies, in their capacity as citizens or residents of New York and/or supporters of public higher education, to urge Governor Hochul to make New York State a national leader in college affordability and in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY's missions.

BACKGROUND:

1. According to a November 2018 Rockefeller Institute report, SUNY's economic impact is \$28.6 billion (\$6.83 billion in Long Island, \$4.37 billion in Western NY, \$3.94 billion in Central NY, \$3.43 billion in the Capitol Region, \$2.98 billion in the Southern Tier, \$2.53 billion in New York City, \$1.6 billion in the Hudson Valley, \$1.32 billion in the Finger Lakes, \$.82 billion in the Mohawk Valley, and \$.78 billion in the North Country); every dollar invested in SUNY returns \$8.17; and 78 percent of SUNY's 633,000 bachelor's degree graduates in 2006 worked in New York two years after graduation and 64 percent remained in the state eight years later.

According to higher education scholars Walter McMahon and Christopher Newfield, decision-makers consistently underestimate higher education's private non-market goods (on one's health, longevity, happiness, human capital, working conditions, job type and benefits, control over consumption, savings, and family size, and children's education and cognitive development), indirect private market benefits, nonmarket private benefits (both direct and indirect), and social goods (both direct and indirect), leading to an overemphasis on the "personal monetary benefit of a college degree," although this is really "only about one-third" of its "overall value" (Newfield 71). See also Cummings, *et al.*; U.S. Department of Education.

2. See, for instance, the joint statement from the Executive Committees of SUNY UFS, SUNY FCCC, and CUNY UFS from January 2016, "Invest in CUNY and SUNY"; SUNY UFS's January 2019 "New Deal for SUNY and CUNY" resolution; SUNY UFS's January 2020 "SUNY/CUNY Budget" resolution; SUNY UFS's October 2021 "Executive Budget Resolution"; SUNY UFS Executive Committee's February 2022 "Statement on the Executive Budget"; and SUNY UFS's October 2022 "Executive Budget Resolution."

3. For context on the national trend toward long-term disinvestment in the mission and core operating budgets of public colleges and universities by state governments, along with ideas for reversing it, see Benton; Crisp, McClure, and Orphan; Eaton; Fabricant and Brier; Hamilton and Nielsen; Hillman; Isserles; Newfield; Quadlin and Powell; Taylor; and Taylor and Cantwell. For SUNY, see State University of New York and UUP; for CUNY, see Davis.

Tables 1-5 provide evidence that New York State is not yet a national leader in college affordability or in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY's missions.

Table 1. New York State's Tax Appropriations and Rank among States of State Tax Funds for Operating Expenses of Public and Private Higher Education per \$1,000 Personal Income and per Capita, 2008, 2014-2022.

Fiscal Year	Appropriations/\$1K	Rank	Appropriations/capita	Rank
2008	\$5.70	38	\$266.17	23

2014	\$4.92	37	\$269.98	20
2015	\$5.00	32	\$281.37	16
2016	\$4.85	34	\$286.96	19
2017	\$4.84	34	\$292.07	20
2018	\$4.66	34	\$302.76	16
2019	\$4.60	34	\$314.58	16
2020	\$4.53	37	\$315.45	18
2021	\$3.86	35	\$287.66	19
2022	\$3.96	40	\$300.45	22

Source: Grapevine

What good reason can there be for NYS to never have been inside the top 30 in appropriations per thousand dollars of personal income or the top 15 in appropriations per capita since the Great Recession? Clearly, as a large, wealthy state, NYS has the capacity to become a true national leader.

Table 2. New York State Capacity and Effort Peer Comparisons, Fiscal Year 2019.

State	Effective Tax Rate and rank (FY19)	Higher Education Allocations as percentage of revenues, and rank	HEA per Capita (in constant 2020 dollars), and rank	HEA/\$1K Personal Income (in constant 2020 dollars), and rank
NY	10.10% (5)	3.50% (44)	\$361 (12)	\$4.89 (30)
CA	8.50% (T11)	6.40% (T15)	\$493 (5)	\$6.90 (14)
TX	6.80% (40)	6.80% (14)	\$337 (17)	\$6.15 (19)
FL	6.10% (49)	6.20% (T18)	\$255 (38)	\$4.60 (34)
IL	8.00% (T19)	6.40% (T15)	\$432 (9)	\$6.86 (15)
MI	7.40% (28)	5.50% (29)	\$236 (43)	\$4.45 (38)
MA	7.50% (T27)	3.20% (46)	\$253 (39)	\$3.17 (46)
US	7.80% (n/a)	5.50% (n/a)	\$328 (n/a)	\$5.50 (n/a)

Source: State Higher Education Executive Officers Association (SHEEO)

Table 3. New York State Higher Education Allocations, State Financial Aid, and Net Tuition Revenue per Full-Time Equivalent Student, and Student Share Peer Comparisons, Fiscal Year 2021.

State	Higher Education Allocations, and rank	State Financial Aid, and rank	Net Tuition Revenue, and rank	Student Share, and rank
NY	\$12,428 (6)	\$1,231 (10)	\$5,763 (38)	31.70% (41)
CA	\$9,859 (14)	\$1,084 (15)	\$2,533 (49)	20.40% (48)
TX	\$9,039 (21)	\$365 (37)	\$5,567 (40)	38.10% (37)
FL	\$8,323 (28)	\$1,479 (8)	\$2,301 (50)	21.70% (47)
IL	\$18,752 (2)	\$925 (18)	\$8,002 (24)	30.40% (43)
MI	\$8,197 (29)	\$72 (49)	\$14,922 (3)	64.50% (6)
MA	\$9,611 (16)	\$484 (29)	\$5,646 (39)	37.00% (38)
US	\$9,327 (n/a)	\$921 (n/a)	\$6,723 (n/a)	42.10% (n/a)

Source: State Higher Education Executive Officers Association (SHEEO)

Table 4. New York State’s Rank among States on State Support (mostly actual tax revenues and lottery profits) in Constant Adjusted Dollars for Operating Expenses of Public Higher Education per \$1,000 Personal Income, per Capita, per Student FTE, as Share of Total State Revenues, on Student Share (net tuition revenue as a percentage of total state revenue), and on State Public Financial Aid per Student FTE, 1980, 2001, 2008-2021.

Fiscal Year	Support/\$1K (rank)	Support/capita (rank)	Support/FTE (rank)	State Allocation (rank)	Student Share (rank)	Aid/FTE (rank)
1980	7.73 (34)	267 (25)	11,835 (9)	5.7% (44)	19.6% (16)	
2001	5.17 (44)	281 (38)	11,616 (20)	3.8% (48)	29.7% (23)	1,944 (1)
2008	5.90 (36)	343 (27)	11,898 (15)	3.9% (45)	30.0% (13)	1,970 (3)
2009	6.38 (35)	364 (19)	11,960 (9)	4.2% (45)	30.2% (12)	1,930 (4)
2010	5.94 (32)	345 (20)	11,250 (9)	4.1% (44)	32.5% (14)	2,005 (4)
2011	5.66 (32)	335 (20)	11,092 (7)	3.8% (44)	32.5% (11)	1,844 (4)
2012	5.27 (30)	321 (20)	10,140 (8)	3.6% (44)	35.5% (9)	1,972 (3)
2013	5.46 (29)	331 (16)	10,571 (8)	3.6% (44)	35.7% (9)	1,948 (3)
2014	5.43 (29)	337 (16)	10,808 (7)	3.6% (44)	36.1% (9)	1,920 (3)
2015	5.42 (29)	350 (15)	11,114 (7)	3.6% (44)	35.7% (10)	1,974 (3)
2016	5.33 (30)	352 (14)	11,275 (6)	3.5% (45)	36.6% (9)	1,955 (5)
2017	5.16 (32)	358 (14)	11,419 (7)	3.7% (44)	35.7% (10)	1,906 (4)

2018	5.16 (28)	365 (11)	11,655 (6)	3.5% (44)	33.4% (8)	2.004 (5)
2019	5.10 (28)	371 (12)	11,900 (6)	3.5% (44)	33.0% (8)	1,978 (6)
2020	4.89 (29)	369 (13)	12,014 (8)		32.9% (10)	1,920 (7)
2021			11,735 (12)		31.7% (10)	1,703 (9)

Source: State Higher Education Executive Officers Association (SHEEO)

Since the Great Recession, NYS has drastically reduced its support for SUNY and CUNY per thousand dollars of personal income and cut its allocation as a percentage of total state revenues, a clear reduction in effort relative to capacity. (The main reason its rankings have generally held steady or improved during that time period is that other states have made even deeper cuts.) Even marginal improvements in columns 2 and 5 would give NYS an excellent opportunity to become a national leader in columns 3, 4, 6, and 7.

How have these kinds of funding decisions affected student debt in NYS?

Table 5. Student Debt, by United States Average, New York State Average and Rank, Percentage of New York State Students Graduating with Debt and Rank, New York State Public Four-Year Average, and Percentage of New York State Public Four-Year Students Graduating with Debt, 2008-2019.

Grad Year	US ave	NY ave (rank)*	NY %age (rank)*	NY 4Y Public ave	NY 4Y Public %age
2008	\$21,167	\$23,580	62%	\$18,026	56%
2009	\$22,522	\$25,590	63%	\$20,911	56%
2010	\$23,540	\$26,360	61%	\$21,706	55%
2011	\$24,854	\$25,764 (19)	60% (25)	\$20,561	54%
2012	\$25,903	\$25,686 (27)	60% (23)	\$20,875	55%
2013	\$26,406	\$26,371 (25)	60% (26)	\$21,720	55%
2014	\$27,052	\$27,822 (19)	61% (25)	\$23,774	53%
2015	\$27,992	\$29,320 (18)	59% (31)	\$24,307	52%

2016	\$28,711	\$30,303 (15)	58% (27)	\$25,967	58%
2017	\$29,000	\$30,931 (13)	60% (15)	\$26,380	54%
2018	\$29,200	\$31,127 (15)	59% (17)	\$26,456	56%
2019	\$28,950	\$31,155 (16)	58% (22)	\$26,674	55%

Source: The Institute for College Access and Success, College Insight

*Ranked from highest to lowest in student debt and percentage of students graduating with debt; that is, it’s better to be closer to #50 than #1 in this ranking.

For more on student debt, inequality, and inequities, see Backstrom; Cummings, *et al.*, Espinosa, *et al.*; Schirmer, *et al.*; Taylor, *et al.*; U.S. Department of Education.

Imagine the possibilities for student access and success if Governor Hochul were to lead an ambitious effort to significantly reduce average student indebtedness and the share of indebted students in SUNY and CUNY.

SOURCES AND REFERENCES

Backstrom, Brian, *A Deeper Look at Student Loan Debt in New York State*, Rockefeller Institute of Government, <https://rockinst.org/blog/a-deeper-look-at-student-loan-debt-in-new-york-state/>, November 2018. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Benton, Ned, “The Faculty Gap: Comparison of SUNY and CUNY Senior College Faculty/Student Ratios,” <https://ufsbac.commons.gc.cuny.edu/wp-content/blogs.dir/11465/files/2021/10/FacultyGap.pdf>, September 2021. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Clark, John, W. Bruce Leslie, and Kenneth O’Brien, eds., *SUNY at Sixty: The Promise of the State University of New York* (SUNY P, 2010).

Crisp, Gloria, Kevin McClure, and Cecilia Orphan, eds., *Unlocking Opportunity through Broadly Accessible Institutions* (Routledge, 2022).

Cummings, Kristen, Sophia Laderman, Jason Lee, David Tandberg, and Dustin Weeden, *Investigating the Impacts of State Higher Education Appropriations and Financial Aid* (State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, May 2021) https://sheeo.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/SHEEO_ImpactAppropriationsFinancialAid.pdf. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Davis, James, “Professional Staff Congress/CUNY Testimony: Executive Budget, the City University of New York, FY2024,” https://psc-cuny.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/Testimony_PSC_Feb-2023_State_Budget_Hearing.pdf. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Drescher, Nuala, William Scheuerman, and Ivan Steen, *United University Professions: Pioneering in Higher Education Unionism* (SUNY P, 2019).

Eaton, Charlie, *Bankers in the Ivory Tower* (U of Chicago P, 2022).

Espinosa, Lorelle, Jonathan Turk, Morgan Taylor, and Hollie Chessman, *Race and Ethnicity in Higher Education: A Status Report* (American Council on Education, 2019), <https://www.equityinhighered.org/>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Executive Committees of State University of New York University Faculty Senate, State University of New York Faculty Council of Community Colleges, and City University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Invest in CUNY and SUNY," https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/fccc/position-statements/InvestSUNY_CUNY_Jan2016.pdf, January 2016. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Fabricant, Michael, and Stephen Brier, *Austerity Blues: Fighting for the Soul of Public Higher Education* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2016).

Grapevine, Illinois State University, <https://education.illinoisstate.edu/grapevine/>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Hamilton, Laura, and Kelly Nielsen, *Broke: The Racial Consequences of Underfunding Public Universities* (U of Chicago P, 2021).

Hillman, Nick, *Why Rich Colleges Get Richer & Poor Colleges Get Poorer: The Case for Equity-Based Funding in Higher Education* (Third Way, November 2020), <https://www.thirdway.org/report/why-rich-colleges-get-richer-poor-colleges-get-poorer-the-case-for-equity-based-funding-in-higher-education>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

The Institute for College Access and Success, College Insight, <https://college-insight.org/>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Isserles, Robin, *The Costs of Completion: Student Success in Community College* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2021).

McMahon, Walter, *Higher Learning, Greater Good: The Private and Social Benefits of Higher Education* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2009).

Newfield, Christopher, *The Great Mistake: How We Wrecked Public Universities and How We Can Fix Them* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2016).

Quadlin, Natasha, and Brian Powell, *Who Should Pay? Colleges, Responsibility, and the Public* (Russell Sage Foundation, 2022).

Schirmer, Eleni, Jason Wozniak, Dana Morrison, Joanna Gonsalves, and Rich Levy, "Making the Invisible Visible: Organizing against the Instructionally Harmful,

Antidemocratic Effects of Institutional Debt," *Journal of Academic Freedom* 12 (2021).

Schultz, Lara, *The Economic Impact of the State University of New York* (Rockefeller Institute of Government, November 2018), <https://rockinst.org/issue-area/the-economic-impact-of-the-state-university-of-new-york/>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *SHEF: State Higher Education Finance*, <https://shef.sheeo.org/>, 2010-2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *State Effort and Capacity to Support Higher Education, FY 2019 and 2020*, <https://shef.sheeo.org/state-effort/>, 2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York, *Financial Fact Book for the June 30, 2021 Fiscal Year*.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Advancement of Historically Underrepresented Faculty." http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/190-01-1_advancement_of_historically_underrepresented_faculty.pdf, January 2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Executive Budget Resolution," http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/189-02-1_comm_executive_budget_resolution.pdf, October 2021. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Executive Budget Resolution," http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/192-04-1_resolution_on_the_ny_state_executive_budget.pdf, October 2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "New Deal for SUNY and CUNY," <https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/faculty-senate/plenary/181-03-01.pdf>, January 2019. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "SUNY/CUNY Budget," https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/faculty-senate/plenary/184-01-01_exec_suny_cuny_budget.pdf, January 2020. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Successful Implementation of the SUNY General Education Category 'Diversity: Equity, Inclusion, and Social Justice,'" http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/190-02-1_successful_implementation_of_the_suny_general_education_diversity_category.pdf, January 2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate Executive Committee, "Statement on the Executive Budget," http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/ufs_ec_statement_on_executive_budget__2_22_2022_.pdf, February 2022. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Tandberg, David, Sophia Laderman, and Andy Carlson, *A Federal-State Partnership for True College Affordability* (State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, June 2017) https://sheeo.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Federal-State_Partnership_for_True_College_Affordability.pdf. Accessed 10 October 2023.

Taylor, Barrett, *Wrecked: Deinstitutionalization and Partial Defenses in State Higher Education Policy* (Rutgers UP, 2022).

Taylor, Barrett, and Brendan Cantwell, *Unequal Higher Education: Wealth, Status, and Student Opportunity* (Rutgers UP, 2019).

Taylor, Morgan, Jonathan Turk, Hollie Chessman, and Lorelle Espinosa, *Race and Ethnicity in Higher Education: 2020 Supplement* (American Council on Education, 2020), <https://www.equityinhighered.org/resources/report-downloads/>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

U.S. Department of Education, *Financial Value Transparency and Gainful Employment*, <https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2023/10/10/2023-20385/financial-value-transparency-and-gainful-employment#citation-11-p70005>. Accessed 10 October 2023.

United University Professions, "NY25: A Vision for SUNY and New York," <https://uupinfo.org/NY25/>, December 2019. Accessed 10 October 2023.

United University Professions, "NY HEALS," <https://uupinfo.org/resources/nyheals/>, December 2020. Accessed 10 October 2023.

United University Professions, "Restore Opportunity, Restore SUNY," <https://uupinfo.org/legislation/pdf/UUP22StateLegAgenda.pdf>. Accessed 10 October 2023.